

II. PRESENTATION OF DATA

A. For-Profit Education Companies

Table 7. Presentation of Data: Berlitz International, Inc.

CRITERIA	DATA
SOURCES	Bennett and Foy (July 30 and August 5, 1998); Jacoby (August 5, 1998); Berlitz (July 30, 31 and August 14, 1998); and http://www.berlitz.com (July 31, 1998).
COMPANY OVERVIEW	
Street Address, URL and Phone	North American headquarters: 400 Alexander Park, Princeton NJ 08540; 609 514 9650 Berlitz Language Centers Division: 2 Rector Street, New York NY 10006; 212 766 2388 http://www.berlitz.com
Management Contacts	John Bennett, Northeastern Regional Director John Foy, National Pedagogical Director
Lines of Business	Berlitz operates three divisions: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Languages Centers, which delivers instructions through a network of 320 locations in 34 countries; • Translation, which offers document translation and interpretation services at 35 locations in 18 countries; and • Publishing, which produces over 1000 titles in self-study, software, reference tools and travel guides.
Institutional Partnerships	As niche programs of the Language Centers division, Berlitz offers Berlitz Jr., Berlitz Study Abroad and Berlitz on Campus programs in the K-12 and post-secondary markets. With the exception of Berlitz Jr. Partnerships with elementary and secondary schools across the US, these niche programs target the individual consumer.
Revenue	Benesse Corporation, a leading Japanese publisher of educational materials and that country's largest after-school tutoring company, owns approximately two thirds of Berlitz. The remaining portion is publicly traded. In 1997, Berlitz's revenues hit \$397.2 million, of which language lessons accounted for \$5.5 million. Berlitz's financial statements do not break out revenue for any of the niche programs described above.

(Berlitz continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
SUBJECT AREAS	
Reading	Berlitz does not teach reading.
Writing	Berlitz does not teach writing.
Mathematics	Berlitz does not teach mathematics.
English as a Second Language (ESL)	All data contained in this grid refers to Berlitz's ability to teach English as a second language.

(Berlitz continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
<p>ASSESSMENT Standardized Norm- or Criterion-Referenced Testing</p>	<p>Berlitz uses its own battery of oral, written and computer-based criterion-referenced tests to determine a student's language proficiency:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A native speaker engages the student in conversation that begins at a simple grammatical level and gradually grows more complex. Weak skills are detected in 3-5 minutes; strong, nuanced skills are detected in about 15 minutes. • Berlitz administers an essay test requiring students to choose a topic from a standard menu. Students are given 45 minutes to write 300 words. • Berlitz administers a computer-based test that is adaptive in nature. Students work through the software in 15-20 minutes. In addition, for CUNY students, Berlitz says it could administer the TOEFL. <p>Berlitz has proposed a remedy for CUNY's inability to differentiate a student's fundamental lack of reading and writing skills from a lack of English language skills. Berlitz proposes administering two tests, one in English and one in the student's native language that evaluate speaking and writing skills. Berlitz says that since a student's writing ability cannot exceed her reading ability, only a writing test is needed to ascertain minimum proficiency in reading and writing. The evaluation would include the conversation and essay components described in the preceding paragraph.</p> <p>Because the large number of students who would be tested, Berlitz recommends using computer-based assessment instruments wherever possible. For evaluation of English proficiency, Berlitz would rely on its English CD-ROM Placement Evaluation product. The software generates two scores – one for grammar and vocabulary and one for listening comprehension – that correlate to Berlitz's taxonomy of language proficiency. For native-language proficiency, Berlitz would rely on its similar products, for example in Spanish and French. Because the computer-based evaluation does not measure writing skills, Berlitz says it could add an "essay-type writing evaluation."</p>
<p>Diagnostic-Prescriptive Pre-Testing</p>	<p>Students' performance on the criterion-referenced test is correlated to Berlitz's taxonomy of language proficiency levels. Twelve levels comprise a basic range of skills from functioning in everyday situations to functions in social and professional situations; an intermediate range of skills capped off by professional or academic proficiency; an advanced range of skills capped off with "higher order communications skills"; and a near-native range of skills that enable a student to undertake demanding linguistic tasks like negotiation.</p>
<p>Individualized Analysis of Basic Skills and Instructional Plans</p>	<p>A student's current and desired language proficiencies are indexed according to Berlitz's taxonomy and lessons are assigned accordingly.</p>
<p>Standardized Post-Testing</p>	<p>Berlitz does not conduct standardized post-testing. Students are evaluated by highly, uniformly trained instructors.</p>

(Berlitz continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
CURRICULUM Mastery Learning	Berlitz uses a “building block” approach: “During the early stages of instruction, primary emphasis is given to establishing basic structure. As each structure is introduced (and thoroughly practiced), it forms a groundwork which serves a springboard to the next structure, which is in turn combined into still other structures....Berlitz proceeds from simple concepts to complex ones, from concrete to abstract....Likewise, students are first taught to identify and describe the people and objects in their immediate surroundings. This is then expanded to permit them to discuss abstract relationships, feelings, emotions, conditions, cause/effect relationships, <i>etc.</i> ”
Adult Learning Theory	Berlitz does not integrate adult learning theory into its curricula.
Developmental Learning Theory	Berlitz does not integrate developmental learning theory into its curricula.
INSTRUCTION Methods of Instruction	For the CUNY, Berlitz recommends a version of its Total Immersion product. For seven and one half hours a day for two to six weeks, students participate in small-group instruction. To keep instruction fresh and fast-paced, students are taught alternately by several instructors who model different voices, pronunciation and intonation and speeds of speech. Students even eat lunch together, so that they can participate in social conversation and thereby develop self-confidence and linguistic facility in their second language. The result is improved comprehension. Berlitz also recommends computer-based instruction for students having difficulty mastering certain concepts. Time-on-task instruction can bolster weak skills.
Quality of Teaching Staff	Berlitz instructors are all native speakers of the languages they teach. They are trained in the Berlitz Method.
Flexibility of Time and Location	Berlitz says it can deliver instruction in its network of language centers or at any client site.
RESULTS	Berlitz can offer no standardized test results. The company says it does not maintain records in a reportable form and that its 115-year record of serving 35 million students speaks for itself.
PRODUCTIVITY	\$1350 for four hours of beginning language instruction per week for one student over four and one half months.

Table 8. Presentation of Data: Kaplan Educational Centers

CRITERIA	DATA
SOURCES	The Washington Post Company (March 6, 1998); Kaplan (January, June 17, August 5, 11, 18 and 24, 1998); Scherer (August 17, 1998); Stone (August 5, 1998); Grastie (September 24, 1998).
COMPANY OVERVIEW Street Address, URL and Phone	888 Seventh Avenue, New York NY 10106; 212 492 5800 http://www.kaplan.com
Management Contacts	Joseph Scherer PhD, Vice President, Kaplan Learning Services Julia Stone, Product Director, Intervention Programs, Kaplan Learning Services Marty Vespo, Executive Director, Higher Education Group
Lines of Business	Kaplan operates five divisions: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Kaplan Educational Centers, the core business of test preparation; • SCORE! Educational Centers, which provides supplemental support for K-8 students; • Software and Book Publishing, which produces titles in test prep, admissions, career development and study skills; • Kaplan Professional, which delivers workforce training; and • Kaplan Learning Services, which provides supplemental support to K-12 and post-secondary students.
Institutional Partnerships	Kaplan maintains partnerships with five school districts and 48 schools. In addition, the division maintains partnerships with two community colleges, delivering remedial instruction in reading, writing and math.
Revenue	Kaplan is a wholly-owned subsidiary of The Washington Post Company (WPC). According to the WPC's most recent annual report, Kaplan's 1997 revenues hit \$117 million and "showed significant growth in its test preparation and admissions businesses while broadening its product offerings in the areas of after-school learning programs, educational services for schools and universities, career services and publishing." The accompanying financial statements provide no details to back up this statement, however, nor do they break out Kaplan Learning Services division revenue from the rest of Kaplan's revenue.

(Kaplan continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
SUBJECT AREAS Reading	Kaplan’s post-secondary reading products include: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Skills Workshops, which teach students “how to express what they already know or to be reacquainted with basic academic skills learned in high school” before they taken college assessment exams; and• Developmental Education Courses, which “employ a learning model of discovery followed by explicit instruction in order to teach basic skills as well as higher order thinking.” Kaplan’s K-12 product is the Academic Intervention Program, which combines small-group and computer-based instruction in reading, writing and math and is differentiated for elementary and secondary learners.
Writing	Kaplan’s post-secondary reading programs include writing instruction. Kaplan’s K-12 Academic Intervention Program includes writing instruction.
Mathematics	Kaplan has post-secondary mathematics products similar to the reading/writing products. Kaplan’s K-12 Academic Intervention Program includes math instruction.
English as a Second Language (ESL)	The Kaplan Language Learning Model product offers ESL training for international students who wish to gain admission and admission to and eventually receive a degree from an accredited US university. The program targets such academic skills as listening and note-taking, textbook reading skills, vocabulary, English grammar in context, conversation, and test-taking strategies for the TOEFL and other exams.

(Kaplan continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
ASSESSMENT Standardized Norm- or Criterion-Referenced Testing	<p>Post-secondary partnerships: Kaplan is in the midst of a policy change. In the past, Kaplan has relied on its partner's testing program (assessment on such norm-referenced tests as the ASSET, COMPASS and AAPP) and on its partner's placement decisions. Kaplan says that, in the future, students participating in such partnerships will be evaluated according to procedures routinely used in K-12 partnerships.</p> <p>K-12 partnerships: Kaplan uses a variety of nationally recognized norm-referenced instruments (Stanford 9, Terra Nova, MSV Survey of attitude toward reading, Diagnostic Phonics Test and Diagnostic Sight Word Test) and relies heavily on the California Achievement Test (CAT).</p>
Diagnostic-Prescriptive Pre-Testing	<p>Post-secondary partnerships: Once Kaplan adopts a standardized testing program, it will implement diagnostic-prescriptive analysis.</p> <p>K-12 partnerships: Kaplan uses its proprietary methodology of analyzing student test performance, a software program called the Computerized Assessment and Feedback Report (CAF Report), to pinpoint students' specific strengths and weaknesses. CAR Reports are correlated to curriculum components.</p>
Individualized Analysis of Basic Skills and Instructional Plans	<p>Post-secondary partnerships: In the past, Kaplan has not created individualized instruction plans for participants but will in the future.</p> <p>K-12 partnerships: Kaplan uses students' CAF Reports to place them in reading groups, computer-based instructional programs and work groups. Continuous evaluation from teachers and feedback from computer programs are used to adjust each student's instructional program, so that she is working at the proper level.</p>
Standardized Post-Testing	<p>Post-secondary partnerships: Kaplan has not routinely post-tested students participating in its post-secondary partnerships in the past but will in the future.</p> <p>K-12 partnerships: Kaplan routinely post-tests, most frequently on the California Achievement Test (CAT).</p>

(Kaplan continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
CURRICULUM Mastery Learning	Post-secondary partnerships: No. KLS has not practiced mastery learning. K-12 partnerships: Yes. To ensure progress, Kaplan says “instruction is delivered to students strategically placed in small ability groups. Then, direct and systematic instruction is matched to group members’ skillsets.
Adult Learning Theory	Kaplan says any materials it targets to adult students incorporate the ideas of Jack Mezirow on transformative learning, Stephen Brookfield on critical thinking, David Kolb and Bernice McCarthy on learning styles, and Maxine Greene and Paulo Freire on learning as a liberating experience.
Developmental Learning Theory	Kaplan says the materials it targets to adult remedial students incorporates the ideas of Hunter Boylan, who runs the National Center for Developmental Education.
INSTRUCTION Methods of Instruction	Post-secondary partnerships: Kaplan delivers courses through live instruction and uses such techniques as group work, writing across the curricula, lecture and collaborative learning. In the future, Kaplan will add computer-based instruction. K-12 partnerships: Kaplan uses a combination of small-group instruction to engage students in active discussion, to cultivate higher order thinking skills and to foster respect and social skills, and computer-based instruction to reinforce learning through “time on task” repetition.
Quality of Teaching Staff	Post-secondary partnerships: Kaplan does not supply instructor and, instead, re-trains college faculty. K-12 partnerships: Kaplan hires and trains instructors. The company offers no details.
Flexibility of Time and Location	Kaplan says it: “offers basic program models for K-12 and higher education, each of which can be customized to meet specific community needs. Kaplan can work within the parameters you set to design the appropriate instructional program to help you reach your goals for your students. Kaplan has adjusted all of the following elements in the programs it has operated to date: program duration and hours of operation, number of students, point of delivery, method of assessment, technology, staff and curriculum.”

(Kaplan continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
RESULTS	<p>City University of New York (CUNY): Kaplan delivered workshops covering material on the FSATs for prospective students. Between February and August 1996, trained Kaplan teachers taught 67 workshops to 7,200. Kaplan created 23,101 CAF Reports for students and CUNY faculty. CUNY has not released participants' test scores to Kaplan.</p> <p>Chattanooga TN State Technical Community College: Kaplan has been delivering courses in remedial reading and writing since Fall 1997 and will continue through Spring 2000. Kaplan offers no standardized test results.</p> <p>Greenville SC Technical College: Kaplan has been delivering courses in remedial reading, writing and math since Fall 1997 and will continue through Spring 2000. Kaplan offers no standardized test results.</p> <p>George Washington High School, New York City Public Schools: Kaplan delivered 55 hours on small-group and computer-based instruction in reading comprehension and vocabulary to 9th graders. Kaplan conducted diagnostic-prescriptive pre-testing as well as post-testing using the CAT.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• In comprehension, the number of students reading at or below the 3rd grade level, between the 4th and 8th grade levels and at the 9th through 12th grade levels, respectively, dropped 17%, rose 13% and rose 4%.• In vocabulary, the number of students reading at or below the 3rd grade level, between the 4th and 8th grade levels and at the 9th through 12th grade levels, respectively, dropped 16%, rose 13% and rose 2%. <p>Los Angeles CA Unified School District: Kaplan delivered six hours of small-group and computer-based instruction in reading and math at 25 public schools weekly in Summer and Spring 1998. Kaplan pre- and post-tested students on the CAT and Stanford 9. Stanford 9 results are not yet available. CAT scores for reading vocabulary and comprehension in 16 locations are as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• at the Elizabeth Learning Center, 71 students gained an average of 0.7 GLEs (p<.001);• at Santa Monica, 28th Street and 95th Street elementary schools, gained 0.1-0.6 GLEs in vocabulary (p<.001), 0.4-0.9 GLEs in comprehension (p<.001) and 0.5-0.6 GLEs total (p<.002);• at five high schools – Huntington, Roosevelt, Jefferson, Locke and Wilson – students showed some gains that were not significant; and• at six high schools – Hollywood, Los Angeles, Banning, Dorsey, Belmont and Franklin – students gained 0.4-3.4 GLEs in vocabulary (p<.001), 0.4-4.0 GLEs in comprehension and 0.4-3.7 GLEs total.

(Kaplan continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
RESULTS (continued)	<p>Los Angeles CA Archdiocese: Kaplan delivered six hours of small-group and computer-based instruction in reading and math at six parochial schools in Summer and Spring 1998 (partnership will continue thorough Fall 1998). Kaplan pre- and post-tested students on the CAT and Stanford 9 exam. Test results are not yet available.</p> <p>Philadelphia Private Industry Council & Philadelphia PA Public Schools: Kaplan delivered 120 hours of computer-based and small-group instruction in reading, writing and math to 900 high school students. Kaplan delivered seminars in careers, study skills and test prep. Kaplan pre- & post-tested on the CAT. Test results are not yet available.</p>
PRODUCTIVITY	<p>\$505 per pupil at George Washington High School in New York City in Spring 1998.</p> <p>\$673 per pupil cost at the Los Angeles Unified School District (LAUSD) for three-semester program.</p>

Table 9. Presentation of Data: Huntington Learning Centers, Inc.

CRITERIA	DATA
SOURCES	Huntington (July 31 and August 6 and 11, 1998; and April 8, 1999); Briggs (July 31 and August 3, 1998); and Kent (December 3, 1997).
COMPANY OVERVIEW Street Address, URL and Phone	496 Kinderkamack Road, Oradell NJ 07649; 201 261 8400 http://www.huntingtonlearningcenters.com
Management Contacts	Louise Cue, Manager, Schools Services Kathy Connolly, Operations Manager Kerry Smith, School Services Assistant
Lines of Business	Huntington’s primary business is supplemental education and tutoring at its 200 learning centers in 30 states. Each year, Huntington instructs 10,000 students in reading, writing and math skills. In addition, Huntington has a small Contract Services division that primarily delivers SAT and ACT test prep to secondary schools.
Institutional Partnerships	<p>Just over a year ago, Huntington began delivering supplemental instruction in basic skills at elementary and secondary schools. The Contract Services division maintains partnerships as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • delivering SAT prep to 25 college-bound junior at Delaware Valley High School, Frenchtown NJ; • delivering reading instruction to 60 under-performing students at Shade Elementary School, Washington DC; and • delivering math instruction to 75 under-performing students at Hart Middle School, Washington DC. <p>As of this writing, Huntington says it is in negotiations with the Englewood NJ Town Council to provide SAT services to the town’s college-bound high school seniors and in discussions with the BOE here in New York concerning summer school programs.</p> <p>In Spring 1988, Huntington delivered reading instruction to about 120 8th graders at Browne Junior High school and Paul Junior High School in Washington, DC.</p> <p>The company has not partnered with a post-secondary school.</p>
Revenue	Huntington is wholly-owned by Dr. Raymond and Eileen Huntington, the husband-and-wife team that founded the company 20 years ago. The company does not publish financial data.

(Huntington continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
SUBJECT AREAS	
Reading	Huntington's reading product offers reading instruction in fundamental decoding, phonics, vocabulary building, drawing conclusions and making inferences.
Writing	Huntington's reading product includes a writing component.
Mathematics	Huntington's math product comprises tests, lessons and related materials systematically presenting concepts ranging from number readiness to trigonometry. The range is broken down into 100 basic skills and 600 sub-skills.
English as a Second Language (ESL)	Huntington does not deliver ESL instruction.
ASSESSMENT	
Standardized Norm- or Criterion-Referenced Testing	In addition to proprietary tests in reading, writing and math, Hunting administers the California Achievement Test (CAT), Slosson Oral Reading Test and Slosson Visual-Motor Performance Test.
Diagnostic-Prescriptive Pre-Testing	Huntington uses a proprietary method to score the battery of diagnostic tests and to create a skills profile and instructional prescriptions for each student.
Individualized Analysis of Basic Skills and Instructional Plans	Each prescription is linked to specific curricular materials. Adjustments are made to the instructional plan as warranted by periodic testing and teacher recommendation.
Standardized Post-Testing	Huntington re-tests each student every 50 instructional hours on different forms of the instruments used for diagnosis.
CURRICULUM	
Mastery Learning	Yes. Huntington says its instructional methodologies are intended to "turn individuals into authentic learners" and "to break the failure chain." The company says its fills in the gap between a student's current level of mastery and the level appropriate for her age and grade. Accordingly, Huntington required that students acquire skills at one level before she can proceed to the next level.
Adult Learning Theory	Huntington does not incorporate adult learning theory into its curricula.
Developmental Learning Theory	Huntington does not incorporate developmental learning theory into its curricula.

(Huntington continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
INSTRUCTION Methods of Instruction	Huntington uses small-group, tutorial model with a student:teacher ratio of no more than 3:1. Huntington uses computer-based instruction as a supplement and as a chance for students to use their new skills independently.
Quality of Teaching Staff	All Huntington teachers meet state certification standards. Before joining a program or learning center, teachers undergo training the company's instructional methods at Huntington Teacher's College. In addition, they participate in monthly faculty meetings where they receive on-going training in different areas of curricula.
Flexibility of Time and Location	Huntington says it can deliver instruction through its two New York City centers (another will open in March 1999) and at any client site. The company says it would create additional centers to accommodate CUNY students.
RESULTS	Washington DC Public Schools: Huntington delivered 40 hours small-group instruction in reading vocabulary and instruction to 112 8 th grade students in Spring 1998. Huntington pre- and post-tested students on the CAT. <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The portion of students at grade level in vocabulary rose from 22% to 38%.• The portion of students at grade level in comprehension rose from 29% to 33%.
PRODUCTIVITY	\$893 per pupil at two junior high schools, Browne and Paul, in Washington DC in Spring 1998.

Table 10. Presentation of Data: Kumon Math and Reading Centers

CRITERIA	DATA
SOURCES	Kumon (August 3, 7 and 11, 1998); Janas (August 3, 1998; and March 19, 1999); Chavez (August 3, 1998); Russell (1993); and http://www.kumon.com (August 3, 1998).
COMPANY OVERVIEW	
Street Address, URL and Phone	North American headquarters: 300 Frank W. Burr Boulevard, Glenpoint Centre East, Teaneck NJ 07666; 201 928 0444 http://www.kumon.com
Management Contacts	Matthew Lupsha, Vice President, Marketing John Janas, US Mathematician and Coordinator of Materials Development
Lines of Business	Kumon is the largest supplemental instruction company in the world. Each year, the company delivers instruction in math, reading and writing to two million students in 40 countries. In North America, Kumon operates nearly 1400 learning centers and maintains partnerships with schools, mostly private or parochial schools. In the US, there are 1022 math centers and 707 math and reading centers. In New York City, there are 39 learning centers, of which 35 deliver instruction in math and reading and four deliver instruction in math only.
Institutional Partnerships	Kumon maintains partnerships with 96 schools, mostly private and parochial, in the US.
Revenue	No financial data is available for Kumon.
SUBJECT AREAS	
Reading	Kumon's reading product is a series of carefully sequenced worksheets that can advance students 17 levels, from tracing letters and learning phonics to writing persuasive essays and performing character analysis.
Writing	Kumon's reading product contains a writing component.
Mathematics	Kumon's math product is a series of carefully sequenced worksheets that can advance students 23 levels, from counting numbers and line drawing through integrals and differential equations. Each level has 200 worksheets addressing more discrete math concepts and skills.
English as a Second Language (ESL)	Kumon does not deliver ESL instruction.

(Kumon continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
ASSESSMENT Standardized Norm- or Criterion-Referenced Testing	Kumon uses only proprietary criterion-referenced instruments. Kumon's math tests are developed in Japan and then translated into English and adapted to American pedagogical conventions.
Diagnostic-Prescriptive Pre-Testing	From the results of the assessment tests in math and reading, Kumon determines a student's highest level of mastery in these subjects. This indicates the most appropriate starting points in Kumon's systematic curricula.
Individualized Analysis of Basic Skills and Instructional Plans	Kumon purposely starts each student slightly below her highest level of mastery. In this way, the student is comfortable; she is likely to achieve an early success and gain confidence and momentum with the linear curriculum.
Standardized Post-Testing	In the learning centers and school partnerships, Kumon tests each student at the end of each curriculum unit. She cannot pass on to the next level without passing her unit test with 100% accuracy in an allocated time period. Kumon does not collect and aggregate data on student achievement as a result of the math and reading programs.
CURRICULUM Mastery Learning	Yes. Kumon says: "In every human activity, there is a superior level of understanding or possession of skill that is recognized as mastery. In the Kumon Program, mastery is the point of total comprehension that lets students apply a skill with confidence, speed and accuracy. Students who have mastered a skill often experience a growing confidence and ability to apply and expand that skill at the next, higher level. At each stage of Kumon, mastery of one level leads to success in the next level. When the goal of learning is mastery, students inevitably have to practice some material more than once."
Adult Learning Theory	Kumon does not incorporate adult learning theory into its curricula. Nevertheless, John Janas, who leads product development for the US, says Kumon's math curriculum would be appropriate for adult learners. Because the passages in Kumon's reading curriculum are excerpted from children's literature, Janas cautions that the curriculum might be too juvenile for the adult learner. He says that the 244 adults registered in New York City Kumon centers are probably students in the math program.
Developmental Learning Theory	Kumon does not incorporate developmental learning theory into its curricula.

(Kumon continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
INSTRUCTION Methods of Instruction	Whether enrolled at a center or within a school, Kumon students visit the Kumon classroom twice a week. “Upon arrival, they hand in completed homework assignments. That day’s class work and future homework assignments are prepared in advance and are waiting for the student in an easily accessible file or bin. The student can take any seat and begin to work. First, the student writes his/her name on the worksheet and records the starting time. After completing all of the work, the ending time is recorded. The instructor or assistant then grades the work. Students correct all of their mistakes before leaving and take homework assignments for each day until the next class session.”
Quality of Teaching Staff	The criteria for becoming a Kumon instructor apply to both the learning center and in-school models: applicants must successfully complete all levels of Kumon math and reading. The company says that almost all instructors have bachelors degrees and many have masters and doctoral degrees.
Flexibility of Time and Location	Kumon says a center can be installed anywhere.
RESULTS	Kumon can offer no standardized test results. The company says that it recently conducted a longitudinal study and that data is not yet available.
PRODUCTIVITY	\$338 for four and one half months of instruction in Kumon’s retail centers.

Table 11. Presentation of Data: Sylvan Learning Systems, Inc.

CRITERIA	DATA
SOURCES	Sylvan (Winter 1997; 1998; August 10 and 17, 1998; and April 9 and 22, 1999); Singer and King (August 7, 1998); Morgan Stanley Dean Witter (March 23, 1999); Maryland Higher Education Commission (May 1997); Meyer (August 10, 1998); and McConochie (August 10, 1998).
COMPANY OVERVIEW Street Address, URL and Phone	1000 Lancaster Street, Baltimore MD 21202; 410 843 8000 URL: http://www.educate.com
Management Contacts	Paula Singer, President, Contract Services Buddy Johnson, Senior Vice President, K-12 Partnerships Steven Pines, Managing Director, College and Adult Programs
Lines of Business	The company operates three divisions: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Learning Centers, which provides supplemental support to students of all skills levels K-12; • Prometric, which delivers standardized tests through 200 testing centers in 105 countries; and • Contract Educational Services, which provides supplemental support to K-12 schools, colleges and universities.
Institutional Partnerships	<p>The Contract Educational Services Division maintains partnerships with 116 school districts comprising 134 public and 625 non-public schools and serving 54,000 students. In addition, the division has delivered instruction in basic skills to three senior colleges and one community college. In December 1998, Sylvan contracted with Baltimore City Community College to deliver math instruction to 100-120 students per semester commencing with the spring 1999 semester and ending with the fall 1999 semester.</p> <p>It is important to note that, at the K-12 level, much of the growth of Sylvan's institutional business is due to its acquisitions, completed in 1997, of Remedial Education and Diagnostics Services, Inc. (READ), a provider of Title 1 services to parochial and private schools, and Educational In-Roads (EIR), a provider of remedial and special education services to public and non-public schools.</p>
Revenue	Sylvan is a publicly traded company. Its 1997 revenues hit \$246.2 million, an increase of 35% over 1996. Services delivered to elementary, secondary and post-secondary schools accounted for \$5.3 million, a net increase of \$2.2 million over 1996. Revenue from institutional contracts obtained before December 31, 1996 decreased by \$3.1 million, which Sylvan credits to contract expiration and reduced funding in some districts.

(Sylvan continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
SUBJECT AREAS Reading	Sylvan’s post-secondary reading products include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Academic Reading Program, which addresses individual skill deficiencies and develops comprehension, vocabulary and ability to identify main ideas and draw conclusions. • Methods to Improve Study Skills, which address time management, note taking, study strategies and test-taking.
Writing	Sylvan’s post-secondary reading products include writing instruction.
Mathematics	Sylvan’s post-secondary math product is the Senior Math/Algebra Program, which teaches reasoning, problem solving and emphasizes concepts rather than procedures and using rather than repeating procedures.
English as a Second Language (ESL)	Sylvan’s post-secondary ESL product is the Steps to English Proficiency Program (STEPS), which is a multi-sensory, communicative approach to teaching ESL and is structured around conversation and the physical response method.
ASSESSMENT Standardized Norm- or Criterion-Referenced Testing	Sylvan uses a variety of norm-referenced instruments, including the ASSET, Nelson-Denny, Test of Adult Basic Education (TABE), COMPASS and Accuplacer tests.
Diagnostic-Prescriptive Pre-Testing	From the results of the assessment testing, specific skills gaps and strengths are diagnosed. Sylvan uses proprietary software to score the assessment tests and to create a skills profile and instructional prescriptions for each student.
Individualized Analysis of Basic Skills and Instructional Plans	Each prescription is linked to specific curricular materials and includes a least three levels of difficulty and different instructional modalities (<i>e.g.</i> software, audiovisual, print-based). Student educational plans are maintained in individual portfolios. Once a student demonstrates mastery at a given program level, she proceeds to the next level of learning.
Standardized Post-Testing	In partnerships with post-secondary schools, depending on client preferences, Sylvan does not routinely post-test. In partnerships with K-12 schools, Sylvan routinely post-tests, most frequently on the California Achievement Test (CAT).

(Sylvan continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
CURRICULUM Mastery Learning	Yes. To ensure progress, Sylvan says it fosters “readiness to learn” by strengthening reading and study skills; “ability to understand instruction” through user-friendly learning materials; high quality of instruction by maintaining a student:teacher ratio or no more than 8:1; and perseverance by rewarding students for hard work.
Adult Learning Theory	Yes, at the post-secondary level. Sylvan says its instructional materials, both print and software have been carefully selected with adult learners in mind and incorporate “a wide cross-section of published materials.” In addition, to accommodate different preferences, Sylvan maintains a variety of instructional materials. Sylvan says its instructional practices have been “evaluated and validated” by the National Center for Developmental Education.
Developmental Learning Theory	Sylvan says that, through small-group instruction, it fosters learning communities and peer support groups.
INSTRUCTION Methods of Instruction	Sylvan uses a combination of: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Small-group instruction, about 6-8 students per teacher;• Computer-based instruction (about 25%); and• Homework assignments for reinforcing skills.
Quality of Teaching Staff	Sylvan faculty, including substitutes, have at least a bachelor’s degree in the content area being taught or in education and have at least three year of prior teaching experience. Preferred qualifications include experience using instructional technology.

(Sylvan continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
Flexibility of Time and Location	<p>Sylvan says it can deliver courses during traditional semesters, abbreviated semesters, immersion sessions, workshops and on weekends and summer vacations. In addition, through its workforce training division, Sylvan has distance learning capability via internet and broadcast satellite technologies. Furthermore, Sylvan can access its learning center network, locate portable classrooms, retrofit existing classrooms and lease its own space. Specific configurations for K-12 and post-secondary students include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• brush-up workshops for the least needy (12-24 hours);• immersion programs for intensive skill development (60-95) hours;• semester-long courses for working through as many skills levels as possible; and• learning center access for individualized instructional needs, determined through diagnostic-prescriptive testing.
RESULTS	<p>NOTE: SYLVAN SUBMITTED DATA FOR POST-SECONDARY AND K-12 PARTNERSHIPS.</p> <p>Columbia College: Sylvan delivered 40 hours of remedial math and reading instruction via the learning center model to students at or below the 9th grade level. Columbia is an open admission art school in Chicago IL. Sylvan pre- and post-tested on the Test of Adult Basic Education (TABE). Data is available from only Spring and Fall 1997. Math program participants pre-tested at grade 7.71 and post-tested at grade 10.34. Reading program participants pre-tested at grade 7.76 and post-tested at grade 10.35.</p> <p>Bowie State University, University of Maryland System: Sylvan delivered 95 hours of instruction each in reading, writing and math to 25 students in the Emerging Scholars Program (ESP) at Bowie State, a historically black college. provides a second chance at admission. An assessment exam administered at the end of the program determines admission. Though only a few students typically gain admission, all Sylvan participants did. Sylvan pre- and post-tested on the ASSET math exam and the California Achievement Test (CAT) reading sub-test, but says results are not available.</p>

(Sylvan continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
RESULTS (continued)	<p>Towson University, University of Maryland System: Sylvan has delivered three levels of remedial mathematics each semester since Spring 1997 and will continue through Spring 1999. Sylvan can offer no standardized test results.</p> <p>Howard Community College, Maryland Community College System: Sylvan delivered two levels of remedial math from Summer 1995 through Fall 1997. Sylvan can offer no standardized test results.</p> <p>Newark NJ Public School System: Sylvan has operated learning centers at three high schools since February 1996. Each year, Sylvan delivers reading, writing and math tutoring to 450 students in 9th-12th grades in preparation for NJ's basic skills exam, the High School Proficiency Test (HSPT). Program participants are students who had previously failed the HSPT. As of February 1998, participants were passing the HSPT at a rate of 41.4%, 12.1% higher than non-participants. Note: Newark students were included in Sylvan's study of nationwide and district cohorts below.</p> <p>Washington DC Public School System: In Spring 1988, Sylvan operated learning centers in five high schools and offered small-group and computer-based instruction in reading and math. All students were pre- and post-tested on the CAT.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• 38 students who spent over 50 hours on reading skills, on average, pre-tested at 13 normal curve equivalents (NCEs) and post-tested at 16 NCEs in vocabulary and pre-tested at 10 NCEs and post-tested at 14 NCEs in comprehension.• 148 students who spend 36-49 hours on reading skills, on average, pre-tested at 23 NCEs and post-tested at 27 NCEs in vocabulary and pre-tested at 16 NCEs and post-tested at 23 NCEs in comprehension.• 53 students who spent over 50 hours on math skills, on average, pre-tested at 25 NCEs and post-tested at 33 NCEs in computation and pre-tested at 21 NCEs and post-tested at 30 NCEs in concepts.• 17 students who spent 36-49 hours on math skills, on average, pre-tested at 28 NCEs and post-tested at 37 NCEs in computation and pre-tested at 19 NCEs and post-tested at 28 NCEs in concepts. <p>Los Angeles CA Unified School District: Sylvan delivered small-group and computer-based instruction in reading and math in Summer and Spring 1998 (partnership will continue through Fall 1998). Results are not yet available. We note that equity analysts at Morgan Stanley Dean Witter reported poor management in Sylvan's contract services division, especially with respect to the LAUSD partnership, that suppressed corporate performance (<i>Equity Research Briefing Note</i>, March 23, 1999). Perhaps these circumstances inhibited Sylvan from collecting or publishing outcome data.</p>

(Sylvan continued)

CRITERIA	DATA																																																																
RESULTS (continued)	Nationwide Cohort of K-12 Students in Sylvan In-School Programs, 1997-1998 School Year: Total NCE on the California Achievement Test in Reading																																																																
	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Population</th> <th>N</th> <th>Pre-Test NCE</th> <th>Post-Test NCE</th> <th>NCE Gain</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Total</td> <td>5,439</td> <td>24</td> <td>31</td> <td>7</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Elementary School</td> <td>2,479</td> <td>25</td> <td>33</td> <td>8</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Middle School</td> <td>2,416</td> <td>24</td> <td>29</td> <td>5</td> </tr> <tr> <td>High School</td> <td>544</td> <td>20</td> <td>26</td> <td>6</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Population	N	Pre-Test NCE	Post-Test NCE	NCE Gain	Total	5,439	24	31	7	Elementary School	2,479	25	33	8	Middle School	2,416	24	29	5	High School	544	20	26	6																																							
Population	N	Pre-Test NCE	Post-Test NCE	NCE Gain																																																													
Total	5,439	24	31	7																																																													
Elementary School	2,479	25	33	8																																																													
Middle School	2,416	24	29	5																																																													
High School	544	20	26	6																																																													
	Note: Table Excludes LAUSD Outcome Results																																																																
	District Cohorts of K-12 Students in Sylvan In-School Programs, 1997-1998 School Year: Average NCE Gains on the California Achievement Test in Reading, by Test Section																																																																
	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>District</th> <th>Vocabulary</th> <th>Comprehension</th> <th>Total</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Baltimore County</td> <td>9</td> <td>12</td> <td>11</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Baltimore</td> <td>7</td> <td>8</td> <td>8</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Broward (FL)</td> <td>2</td> <td>4</td> <td>4</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Chicago</td> <td>2</td> <td>7</td> <td>5</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Detroit</td> <td>4</td> <td>7</td> <td>6</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Minneapolis</td> <td>7</td> <td>10</td> <td>9</td> </tr> <tr> <td>New Orleans</td> <td>2</td> <td>7</td> <td>5</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Newark</td> <td>6</td> <td>10</td> <td>8</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Oklahoma</td> <td>4</td> <td>5</td> <td>4</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Pasadena</td> <td>6</td> <td>15</td> <td>10</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Philadelphia</td> <td>5</td> <td>12</td> <td>9</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Richmond</td> <td>5</td> <td>7</td> <td>6</td> </tr> <tr> <td>St. Paul</td> <td>7</td> <td>13</td> <td>10</td> </tr> <tr> <td>St. Louis</td> <td>4</td> <td>6</td> <td>5</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Washington, DC</td> <td>6</td> <td>6</td> <td>6</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	District	Vocabulary	Comprehension	Total	Baltimore County	9	12	11	Baltimore	7	8	8	Broward (FL)	2	4	4	Chicago	2	7	5	Detroit	4	7	6	Minneapolis	7	10	9	New Orleans	2	7	5	Newark	6	10	8	Oklahoma	4	5	4	Pasadena	6	15	10	Philadelphia	5	12	9	Richmond	5	7	6	St. Paul	7	13	10	St. Louis	4	6	5	Washington, DC	6	6	6
District	Vocabulary	Comprehension	Total																																																														
Baltimore County	9	12	11																																																														
Baltimore	7	8	8																																																														
Broward (FL)	2	4	4																																																														
Chicago	2	7	5																																																														
Detroit	4	7	6																																																														
Minneapolis	7	10	9																																																														
New Orleans	2	7	5																																																														
Newark	6	10	8																																																														
Oklahoma	4	5	4																																																														
Pasadena	6	15	10																																																														
Philadelphia	5	12	9																																																														
Richmond	5	7	6																																																														
St. Paul	7	13	10																																																														
St. Louis	4	6	5																																																														
Washington, DC	6	6	6																																																														
PRODUCTIVITY	<p>\$673 per pupil at the Los Angeles Unified School District (LAUSD) for three-semester program.</p> <p>\$2,000 per pupil for remedial math and English instruction administered as needed at Columbia College in Spring 1997 and again in Spring 1998.</p>																																																																

Table 12. Presentation of Data: The Princeton Review (TPR)

CRITERIA	DATA
SOURCES	TPR (July 30 and August 12, and 14, 1998); Lutz (August 6, 1998; and March 24, 1998); and Schwartz (January 10, 1999).
COMPANY OVERVIEW	
Street Address, URL and Phone	2315 Broadway, Floor 2, New York NY 10024-4332; 212 874 8282 http://www.review.com
Management Contacts	John Katzman, Founder and Chief Executive Officer Andy Lutz, Vice President, High School Programs Jeff Rubenstein, Director, High School Research and Development
Lines of Business	The Princeton Review (TPR) offers test preparation for college and graduate school and professional licensing for law and medicine. Each year, TPR delivers instruction to over 2.5 million students through its courses, software and books. In its network of over 500 centers in 60 countries, TPR accommodates 70,000 students annually.
Institutional Partnerships	TPR has no institutional partnerships.
Revenue	Company founder John Katzman and Random House closely own TPR. Financial data is not available.
SUBJECT AREAS	
Reading	TPR maintains that it can analyze any test for the content and skills embedded therein and create a relevant curriculum. In other words, TPR starts with the test and backs into a curriculum. TPR's products include prep courses for the following tests: PSAT, SAT, SAT II, ACT, TOEFL, GRE, GMAT, LSAT, MCAT, USMLE and the Multi-State Bar Examination (MBE). The course curricula include reading strategies.
Writing	TPR's test prep curricula include writing instruction.
Mathematics	TPR's test prep curricula include math instruction.
English as a Second Language (ESL)	TPR equates its TOEFL test prep course with ESL instruction.

(TPR continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
ASSESSMENT Standardized Norm- or Criterion-Referenced Testing	TPR uses both old copies of standardized tests such as the SAT, ACT, GMAT and SLAT and simulated practice exams they create in-house. TPR says the practice exams are normed to the same standards as the originals. For its study skills course, TPR has developed an assessment instrument for pre- and post-testing of basic skills. TPR would use this instrument to pre- and post-test CUNY students.
Diagnostic-Prescriptive Pre-Testing	In all its courses, TPR administers diagnostic pre-tests to pinpoint students strengths and weaknesses. The analysis of these tests does not have a prescriptive component.
Individualized Analysis of Basic Skills and Instructional Plans	TPR generates a "Diagnostic Score Report" that communicates a student's weaknesses to her and suggests areas for study. These messages do not correspond to curricular components.
Standardized Post-Testing	TPR post-tests on the exams it develops in-house.
CURRICULUM	
Mastery Learning	TPR does not practice mastery learning.
Adult Learning Theory	TPR does not incorporate adult theory into its curricula.
Developmental Learning Theory	TPR does not incorporate developmental learning theory into its curricula.

(TPR continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
INSTRUCTION Methods of Instruction	TPR relies on direct classroom instruction. The company says: “Our teaching methods are what set us apart from the rest. We believe in an interactive pedagogic process, wherein the teacher works together with the students to help them learn the processes and skills that they need to succeed. The teacher is not merely a source of information, and the students do not merely passively receive information. The teacher’s job is to attack the material from the students’ point of view and to show them how they, too, can master the material” (Lutz). Although TPR produces software, the company does not integrate its software into its test prep courses.
Quality of Teaching Staff	TPR “finds the best and brightest, trains them to teach and then puts them in front of students” (Lutz).
Flexibility of Time and Location	The length of a TPR course in basic skills would depend on “how many skills would be covered and on how much progress needed to be made.” TPR says it could teach its courses anywhere.
RESULTS	TPR offered the Task Force the average increase in SAT score as a result of its test prep instruction. Roper Starch Worldwide, Inc., an information research firm, claims that the average increase is 136.8 +/- 13.1 points.
PRODUCTIVITY	\$1102 for four and one half months of instruction in connection with TPR’s “Smart Skills” products in math or language arts in its retail centers.

B. Local Independent Colleges and Universities

Table 13. Presentation of Data: Fordham University

CRITERIA	DATA
SOURCES	Badaracco and Hoey (September 14, 1998); Johnson (September 14, 1998); http://www.fordham.edu/acadh/englishsl ; and various marketing materials.
OVERVIEW	
Street Address, URL and Phone	Fordham University English as a Second Language Institute 33 West 60 Street Third Floor New York NY 10023 212 636 6353 http://www.fordham.edu/acadh/englishsl
Lines of Business	
Management Contacts	Irene Badaracco, Acting Director Tim Hoey, Academic Coordinator

(Fordham continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
SUBJECT AREAS	
Reading	<p>Fordham offers only one remedial course, which is in English composition. The course is only offered to matriculated freshmen, two thirds of which take the course.</p> <p>Other supplemental instruction in reading, writing and mathematics is delivered exclusively through Fordham's Higher Education Opportunity Program (HEOP) and, thus, not open to the general population.</p>
Writing	<p>Fordham offers only one remedial course, which is in English composition. The course is only offered to matriculated freshmen, two thirds of which take the course.</p>
Mathematics	
English as a Second Language (ESL)	<p>Fordham delivers 16 courses of ESL instruction in writing, grammar, listening and speaking, and reading and vocabulary. The courses range from beginning level to advanced level, which is adequate for participated in a university degree program.</p>
ASSESSMENT	
Standardized Norm- or Criterion-Referenced Testing	<p>No. Fordham assesses ESL needs on an instrument and essay test it created in-house and through an interview.</p>
Diagnostic-Prescriptive Pre-Testing	<p>Yes. Fordham's assessment tests link to specific parts of its curriculum. The ESL curriculum is separated into six levels of proficiency, with the highest level approaching academic proficiency.</p>
Individualized Analysis of Basic Skills and Instructional Plans	<p>No.</p>
Standardized Post-Testing	<p>No. Fordham re-tests on the instruments it created in-house.</p>
CURRICULUM	
Mastery Learning	<p>No.</p>
Adult Learning Theory	<p>No.</p>
Developmental Learning Theory	<p>No.</p>

(Fordham continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
INSTRUCTION Methods of Instruction	Fordham teaches ESL through oral communication.
Quality of Teaching Staff	ESL instructors have at least a master degree.
Flexibility of Time and Location	Fordham offers courses at a variety of times and dates. Mini-courses in grammar, listening skills and vocabulary development, which are intended for fine-tuning, are held for two hours on Saturdays.
RESULTS	No.
PRODUCTIVITY	The fee for semester-long courses is \$1,000. The fee for mini-courses ranges from \$375 to \$525.

Table 14. Presentation of Data: Iona College

CRITERIA	DATA
SOURCES	Cardiello (September 24, 1998); http://www.iona.edu
OVERVIEW	
Street Address, URL and Phone	Westchester campus: 715 North Avenue, New Rochelle, NY 10801-1890 914 633 9000 http://www.iona.edu Manhattan campus: 350 East 56 Street, New York, NY 10022 212 753 2500
Lines of Business	Iona is a sectarian college in the tradition of the Christian Brothers. The college comprises the Hagan School of Business, the School of Arts and Sciences, and the Center for Adults.
Management Contacts	Judson Shaver, Provost and Vice President for Academic Affairs
SUBJECT AREAS	
Reading	No.
Writing	The School of Arts and Sciences maintains a College Assistance Program (CAP) for students with learning disabilities and yet have “average or above average-average intellectual ability, [are] socially mature, and [are] highly motivated to succeed in college.” Before freshman matriculation, CAP participants attend a three-week immersion program in writing, study skills, and organizational and time management skills. In addition, during the regular school year, Iona offers developmental coursework in English composition including paragraph structure and essay development to 175.
Mathematics	Iona offers developmental coursework in math, including elementary functions and pre-calculus to 325 students a year.
English as a Second Language (ESL)	Iona offers ESL coursework. We have no details.

(Iona continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
ASSESSMENT	
Standardized Norm- or Criterion-Referenced Testing	Iona uses the Descriptive Test of Language Skills to assess English composition skills. Iona uses an instrument developed in-house to assess math skills.
Diagnostic-Prescriptive Pre-Testing	No.
Individualized Analysis of Basic Skills and Instructional Plans	No.
Standardized Post-Testing	No.
CURRICULUM	
Mastery Learning	No.
Adult Learning Theory	No.
Developmental Learning Theory	Yes, Iona uses discovery learning in developmental math courses. The goal of the program is to bring students up to college-level after two semesters.
INSTRUCTION	
Methods of Instruction	English composition courses are taught in lecture, small-group and computer-based formats. Math courses are taught in lecture and small-group formats.
Quality of Teaching Staff	No information.
Flexibility of Time and Location	No.
RESULTS	Iona has no data on student performance as measured by standardized tests.
PRODUCTIVITY	The fee for a three-credit course is \$1,370, which equals annual tuition of \$13,700 amortized over 10 courses.

Table 15. Presentation of Data: Manhattan College

CRITERIA	DATA
SOURCES	Merriman (September 17, 1998); http://www.manhattan.edu/admiss/admiss-html .
OVERVIEW Street Address, URL and Phone	Riverdale NY 10471 718 862 8000 or 1 800 MC2 XCEL http://www.manhattan.edu
Lines of Business	Manhattan offers bachelors and masters degree programs in: liberal arts and general studies; science; engineering; business; and education.
Management Contacts	James Merriman, Dean, School of Education
SUBJECT AREAS Reading	<p>Manhattan offers the “Validation Program,” which services students whose high school record and SAT scores, generally below 1000 combined, indicate that they may not be fully prepared for college-level work. Participants are assigned to special counselors and attend a pre-registration orientation program that offers basic skills instruction. Participants take only four courses in their first semester and, if they achieve a GPA of 2.50 or better after the first semester, participants may take five courses in their second semester. If they achieve a GPA of 2.00 or better after completing 24 credits, about two semesters, participants may matriculate into a degree program.</p> <p>For students in the Validation Program and other students whose skills are lacking, Manhattan offers remedial courses in language arts but not specifically in reading.</p>
Writing	Yes. Manhattan offers a remedial composition course.
Mathematics	Yes. We do not know how many levels.
English as a Second Language (ESL)	No.

(Manhattan continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
ASSESSMENT	
Standardized Norm- or Criterion-Referenced Testing	No.
Diagnostic-Prescriptive Pre-Testing	No.
Individualized Analysis of Basic Skills and Instructional Plans	No.
Standardized Post-Testing	No.
CURRICULUM	
Mastery Learning	No.
Adult Learning Theory	No.
Developmental Learning Theory	No.
INSTRUCTION	
Methods of Instruction	Manhattan delivers courses in a traditional lecture format and supplements such instruction with extensive tutoring.
Quality of Teaching Staff	No information.
Flexibility of Time and Location	No.
RESULTS	No.
PRODUCTIVITY	The fee for each Validation Program course is \$1,875.

Table 16. Presentation of Data: Marymount Manhattan College

CRITERIA	DATA
SOURCES	Grecco (September, 25, 1998); and http://www.marymount.mmm.edu
OVERVIEW Street Address, URL and Phone	221 East 71 Street New York NY 10021-4597 212 517 0400 http://www.marymount.mmm.edu
Lines of Business	
Management Contacts	Margeurita J. Grecco, Associate Dean for Academic Affairs
SUBJECT AREAS Reading	Marymount sponsors the “Bridge to College” program, which offers remedial courses in reading, writing and math. Marymount offers reading courses in: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • speaking and listening; • communication skills; • vocabulary development and reading skills; and • reading study skills.
Writing	Marymount offers a basic composition course and a critical thinking and writing course for English speakers.
Mathematics	Marymount offers two levels of math courses: a basic course in math operations; and a more advanced course in introductory algebra.
English as a Second Language (ESL)	Marymount sponsors the “Institute for English as a Second Language,” which offers nine courses in English grammar and usage, vocabulary and reading comprehension, pronunciation and idiomatic speech, and writing skills and three courses in test prep and study skills for the Test of English as a Foreign Language (TOEFL) to 300 students a year.

(Marymount continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
ASSESSMENT	
Standardized Norm- or Criterion-Referenced Testing	Marymount assesses student reading/writing and math skills on appropriate forms of the Diagnostic Test of Language Skills (DTLS). International students who score below 500 on the TOEFL are required to take ESL classes.
Diagnostic-Prescriptive Pre-Testing	Marymount has diagnostic capability through use of the DTLS instruments.
Individualized Analysis of Basic Skills and Instructional Plans	No.
Standardized Post-Testing	Marymount says students are post-tested in all subjects but provides no explanation of policies and no data.
CURRICULUM	
Mastery Learning	No.
Adult Learning Theory	No.
Developmental Learning Theory	No.
INSTRUCTION	
Methods of Instruction	Marymount uses direct, small-group and computer-based instruction in all its courses. We have no detailed information.
Quality of Teaching Staff	No information.
Flexibility of Time and Location	Some classes are taught in the evening to accommodate working students.
RESULTS	No.
PRODUCTIVITY	The fee for a reading, writing and math course is \$1,950. The fee for one semester-long ESL course ranges from \$325 to \$395.

Table 17. Presentation of Data: New York Institute of Technology

CRITERIA	DATA
SOURCES	NYIT (September 25 and October 2, 1998); and http://www.nyit.edu (September 3, 1998).
OVERVIEW	
Street Address, URL and Phone	Manhattan campus: 1855 Broadway New York NY 10023-7692 212 261 1574
Lines of Business	New York Institute of Technology (NYIT) offers bachelors degrees in 80 majors and masters degrees in 12 majors. NYIT houses the College of Osteopathic Medicine, the only one in New York State.
Management Contacts	Thomas L. Thomas, Assistant Dean for Student Development
SUBJECT AREAS	
Reading	NYIT offers one remedial course in reading.
Writing	NYIT offers one remedial course in writing that incorporates reading instruction.
Mathematics	NYIT offers two levels of remedial math courses.
English as a Second Language (ESL)	NYIT offers 12 courses in reading, writing, speaking and listening, technical and business English, American culture in film, and preparation for the TOEFL exam.
ASSESSMENT	
Standardized Norm- or Criterion-Referenced Testing	No. NYIT assesses students in reading, writing and math on instruments created in-house.
Diagnostic-Prescriptive Pre-Testing	No.
Individualized Analysis of Basic Skills and Instructional Plans	No.
Standardized Post-Testing	No.

(NYIT continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
CURRICULUM	
Mastery Learning	No.
Adult Learning Theory	No.
Developmental Learning Theory	No.
INSTRUCTION	
Methods of Instruction	NYIT uses traditional classroom instruction and does not use computer-based instruction.
Quality of Teaching Staff	No information.
Flexibility of Time and Location	No.
RESULTS	No information.
PRODUCTIVITY	The fee for a remedial reading, writing, math or ESL course is \$1,035.

Table 18. Presentation of Data: New York University

CRITERIA	DATA
SOURCES	NYU (September 22 and 28, 1998); and http://www.nyu.edu .
OVERVIEW Street Address, URL and Phone	<p>School of Continuing and Professional Studies Re-entry Programs, Paul McGhee Adult Degree Studies Division New York University 225 Shimkin Hall 50 West Fourth Street New York NY 10012-1165 212 998 7098 http://www.nyu.edu</p> <p>The American Language Institute 48 Cooper Square Room 200 New York NY 10003-7154 212 998 7040</p>
Lines of Business	
Management Contacts	Elinor Azenberg, Director, Re-entry Programs, Paul McGhee Adult Degree Studies Division William Jex, Director, American Language Institute

(NYU continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
SUBJECT AREAS	
Reading	NYU sponsors the “Adult Transition Program,” which builds and reinforces reading, writing, vocabulary, math, study skills and critical thinking skills. The program is intended to move under-prepared students into associate and bachelors degree program within the Paul McGhee division. The program is not intended for students requiring a great deal of remediation. NYU offers reading instruction in two levels of a course called “Study Strategies.”
Writing	See above. NYU offers one course in grammar and one in writing.
Mathematics	See above. NYU offers one course in remedial math.
English as a Second Language (ESL)	NYU’s American Language Institute offers five courses for beginning students and 17 courses for advanced students. NYU offers seven courses in business English for professionals.
ASSESSMENT	
Standardized Norm- or Criterion-Referenced Testing	NYU assesses students vocabulary, reading comprehension and math skills on the Comprehensive Tests of Basic Skills (CTBS). NYU assess ESL needs through an instrument created in-house and through an interview and writing sample.
Diagnostic-Prescriptive Pre-Testing	NYU has diagnostic capability through use of the CTBS.
Individualized Analysis of Basic Skills and Instructional Plans	No.
Standardized Post-Testing	NYU says that it re-tests reading and math students on the CTBS but that it does not have data “in a form that would be helpful.”

(NYU continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
CURRICULUM	
Mastery Learning	No information.
Adult Learning Theory	No information
Developmental Learning Theory	No information.
INSTRUCTION	
Methods of Instruction	NYU uses direct, small-group instruction.
Quality of Teaching Staff	No information.
Flexibility of Time and Location	Although most meet for four hours each week, NYU's intensive ESL course meets for seven hours a day for four days a week, totally 28 hours each week.
RESULTS	No.
PRODUCTIVITY	The fee for a remedial reading, writing or math course ranges from \$125 to \$145. The fee for four hours of weekly ESL instruction is approximately \$1,820. The fee for the intensive course is \$4,260.

Table 19. Presentation of Data: Pace University

CRITERIA	DATA
SOURCES	http://www.pace.edu . Note: All information on Pace comes from its web site. The academic dean never responded to our request for information.
OVERVIEW Street Address, URL and Phone	41 Park Row 1 Pace Plaza New York NY 10038 212 346 1562 http://www.pace.edu
Lines of Business	
Management Contacts	Mary Joe Russell O'Grady, Dean

(Pace continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
SUBJECT AREAS Reading	<p>Pace sponsors the “Challenge to Achievement at Pace” (CAP) program, which offers credit-bearing courses (two to three each) in reading, reading, writing, speech and math to students who do not meet the university’s regular admissions standards. In order to complete the CAP program and continue their studies, participants must achieve a “C” average on 24 credits and take a “college survival skills” course.</p> <p>The Fall 1998 online course catalog contains 13 sections of the college survival course.</p> <p>The Fall 1998 online course catalog contains: six sections of one remedial reading course; and 10 sections of a remedial speech course.</p>
Writing	<p>The Fall 1998 online course catalog contains three levels of writing courses, including 14 sections of the low level, one sections of an intermediate level and 16 sections of a high level.</p>
Mathematics	<p>The Fall 1998 online course catalog contains three levels of math courses, including six sections of the low level, 13 sections of an intermediate level and two sections of a high level.</p>
English as a Second Language (ESL)	<p>Yes. Pace sponsors the “English Language Institute,” which offers instruction in grammar and writing; reading and vocabulary; and conversation and listening. The institute is intended to serve students who wish to enroll at Pace, after achieving a minimum score on the TOEFL exam, and other post-secondary schools.</p>
ASSESSMENT Standardized Norm- or Criterion-Referenced Testing	<p>No information. Although the web site indicates Pace students take placement exams in language arts and math, the site does not indicate what instruments are used.</p>
Diagnostic-Prescriptive Pre-Testing	<p>No.</p>
Individualized Analysis of Basic Skills and Instructional Plans	<p>No.</p>
Standardized Post-Testing	<p>No information on post-testing in reading, speech, writing and math.</p> <p>Participants in the English Language Institute take a post-test that Pace will accept instead of the TOEFL in the admissions process.</p>

(Pace continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
CURRICULUM Mastery Learning	No information.
Adult Learning Theory	No. information.
Developmental Learning Theory	No information.
INSTRUCTION Methods of Instruction	No information.
Quality of Teaching Staff	No information.
Flexibility of Time and Location	English Language Institute courses are configured in six-, seven- and 14-week time frames. Fourteen-week courses can meet from eight to 20 hours a week. All other courses meet from 12 to 20 hours a week. In addition, Pace says it can tailor programs to meet the needs of special groups. No information on courses in other basic skills.
RESULTS	No information.
PRODUCTIVITY	Fees for remedial courses in reading, speech, writing and math range from \$900 for two credits and \$1,350 for three credits. Fees for the English Language Institute vary by time frame and by weekly instructional hours, as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• six-week courses range from \$264 for four hours to \$1,320 for 20 hours;• seven-week courses range from \$308 for four hours to \$1,540 for 20 hours; and• 14-week courses range from \$1,232 for eight hours to \$3,080 for 20 hours;

Table 20. Presentation of Data: St. Francis College

CRITERIA	DATA
SOURCES	Holloway (September 21 and October 9, 1998); Largo (September 21, 1998); http://www.stfrancis.edu
OVERVIEW Street Address, URL and Phone	180 Remsen Street Brooklyn Heights NY 11201 718 489 5200
Management Contacts	Anthony Largo, Dean of the College Sara Holloway, Director, Freshman Skills Program and Academic Support Center
SUBJECT AREAS Reading	<p>St. Francis offers remedial reading, writing and math instruction in an intensive “Pre-Collegiate Summer Program” and in semester-long courses. The College serves about 500 students each year. Note: St. Francis would not extend its programs to CUNY students; the college believes its programs are successful because they are small.</p> <p>In the intensive format, instruction occurs all day for four weeks. St. Francis concentrates reading and writing in one session and math in another.</p> <p>In the semester format, reading and writing instruction are combined into two levels. The lower level teaches rudimentary skills and the upper level teaches basic composition.</p>
Writing	See above.
Mathematics	St. Francis offers two levels of math courses, beginning and intermediate algebra.
English as a Second Language (ESL)	Yes. We have no specific information.

(St. Francis continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
ASSESSMENT	
Standardized Norm- or Criterion-Referenced Testing	Yes. St. Francis assesses reading and writing skills on the Nelson-Denny exam and math skills on the math version of the Descriptive Test of Language Skills (DTLS).
Diagnostic-Prescriptive Pre-Testing	Yes.
Individualized Analysis of Basic Skills and Instructional Plans	Yes. Each incoming student receives a study plan covering the freshman year, including remedial programs, and the first semester of the second year, covering the student's first credit-level courses.
Standardized Post-Testing	Yes. St. Francis post-tests on the same instruments it uses for pre-testing.
CURRICULUM	
Mastery Learning	No.
Adult Learning Theory	No.
Developmental Learning Theory	Yes. St. Francis's remedial English classes comprise instructional hours and compulsory tutoring sessions.
INSTRUCTION	
Methods of Instruction	St. Francis uses small-group instruction. Its remedial classes have no more than 15 students. Math courses place emphasis on drills and problem solving. Although St. Francis does not currently use computer-based instruction, it is reviewing software for writing and grammar skills.
Quality of Teaching Staff	All instructors in the Pre-Collegiate Summer Program have masters degrees and previous college teaching experience. We have no information on the instructors of the semester courses.
Flexibility of Time and Location	No.

(St. Francis continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
RESULTS	<p>St. Francis offers data on student performance in reading/writing and math after participation in the Pre-Collegiate Summer Program.</p> <p>The college says that the following numbers indicate a jump of one grade level and exceed St. Francis's cut score for its lowest level remedial course in reading and writing.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• In Summer 1994, 56 students participated in a reading/writing session. In reading, on average, they pre-tested at the 26.72 percentile and post-tested at the 36.05 percentile. In sentence structure, on average, they pre-tested at the 12.59 percentile and post-tested at the 29.02 percentile.• In Summer 1995, 28 students participated in a reading/writing session. In reading, on average, they pre-tested at the 16.70 percentile and post-tested at the 33.96 percentile. In sentence structure, on average, they pre-tested at the 24.00 percentile and post-tested at the 36.96 percentile.• In Summer 1996, 56 students participated in a reading/writing session. In reading, on average, they pre-tested at the 14.27 percentile and post-tested at the 25.96 percentile. In sentence structure, on average, they pre-tested at the 18.15 percentile and post-tested at the 28.76 percentile.• In Summer 1997, 56 students participated in a reading/writing session. In reading, on average, they pre-tested at the 27.13 percentile and post-tested at the 33.89 percentile. <p>The college says that the following numbers indicate a jump of one grade level and exceed St. Francis's cut score for its lowest level remedial course in math.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• In Summer 1994, 55 students participated in a math session. On average, they pre-tested at the 20.32 percentile and post-tested at the 66.93 percentile.• In Summer 1995, 71 students participation in a math session. On average, they pre-tested at the 18.79 percentile and post-tested at the 56.14 percentile.• In Summer 1996, 54 students participated in a math session. On average, they pre-tested at the 17.60 percentile and post-tested at the 56.91 percentile.• In summer 1997, 58 students participated in a math session. On average, they pre-testes at the 21.76 percentile and post-tested at the 69.33 percentile. During the same period, 26 participated in a higher level session covering intermediate algebra. On average, they pre-tested at the 27.27 percentile and post-tested at the 77.73 percentile.
PRODUCTIVITY	The cost of non-credit, remedial courses is \$780. St. Francis offers the summer immersion program fee to incoming freshmen.

Table 21. Presentation of Data: St. John's University

CRITERIA	DATA
SOURCES	Hall, Halpin, Joseph-Silverstein, Malone, Mulvihill and Russo (September 30, 1998); St. John's (September 30, 1998); and http://www.stjohns.edu
OVERVIEW Street Address, URL and Phone	8000 Utopia Parkway Jamaica, NY 11439 http://www.stjohns.edu
Lines of Business	St. John's offers bachelors degrees in liberal arts through St. Vincent's College and Notre Dame College and in business through the College of Business Administration. The university offers associates and bachelors degrees and continuing education through Metropolitan College for adult learners.
Management Contacts	Jackie Joseph-Silverstein, Associate Provost for Academic Affairs Mary Mulvihill, Dean, Metropolitan College

(St. John's continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
SUBJECT AREAS Reading	<p>St. John's sponsors the "College Admissions Program," which offers three levels of non-credit courses math, a course in composition and critical reading, and an additional workshop in reading. The program, which is open to high school graduates and GED holder, serves about 300 people a year in each segment.</p> <p>The goal of the reading workshop is to advance students two grade levels over the course of 20 hours of instruction.</p> <p>Metropolitan College sponsors supplemental reading, writing and math instruction, as well as other subjects, to over 700 students in 1st through 11th grades. High school curricula follow New York State Regents standards.</p>
Writing	<p>See above. St. John's composition course has speech and study skills components in addition to critical reading.</p> <p>See above for Metropolitan College writing programs for elementary students, too.</p>
Mathematics	<p>See above. St. John's remedial three levels of math courses are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• basic algebra;• advanced algebra and trigonometry; and• advance algebra with preparation for higher math courses. <p>See above for Metropolitan College math programs for elementary students, too.</p>
English as a Second Language (ESL)	<p>In addition to its other basic skills programs, St. John's sponsors the "Intensive English Program," which delivers ESL instruction to 135 students each year.</p>

(St. John's continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
ASSESSMENT Standardized Norm- or Criterion-Referenced Testing	In the College Admissions Program, St. John's assesses: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• reading skills on the Stanford Diagnostic Reading Test (Stanford 9);• math skills on an instrument created in-house;• writing skills on an essay test created in-house; and• English language skills on an instrument created in-house. In Metropolitan College programs, St. John's assesses reading and math skills on the Stanford Achievement Test.
Diagnostic-Prescriptive Pre-Testing	St. John's has diagnostic capability through use of the Stanford test.
Individualized Analysis of Basic Skills and Instructional Plans	No.
Standardized Post-Testing	For reading, St. John's post-tests students who have participated in two workshops.

(St. John's continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
CURRICULUM Mastery Learning	No.
Adult Learning Theory	No.
Developmental Learning Theory	No.
INSTRUCTION Methods of Instruction	<p>In the reading workshops, St. John's employs direct, small-group and individual instruction.</p> <p>In math courses, St. John's uses direct instruction.</p> <p>In ESL courses, St. John's stresses oral communication.</p> <p>In Metropolitan College courses for elementary and secondary school students, St. John's uses small-group and individual instruction. The college will implement computer-based instruction in the future.</p>
Quality of Teaching Staff	No information.
Flexibility of Time and Location	St. John's offers only semester courses in fall, spring and summer.
RESULTS	St. John's
PRODUCTIVITY	<p>Metropolitan College fees are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$325 for one subject; and • \$640 for two subjects.

C. New York City Adult Literacy Initiative (NYCALI)

Table 22. Presentation of Data: New York City Adult Literacy Initiative (NYCALI)

CRITERIA	DATA
SOURCES	Alladice (September 25, 1998); Askins (November, 1997); Fish (October 6, 1998); and NYCALI (April, 1998 and August 1, 1997).
OVERVIEW Street Address, URL and Phone	New York City Mayor's Office of Adult Literacy (MOAL) 52 Chambers Street Room 215 New York NY 10007 212 788 0283
Lines of Business	<p>NYCALI, established in 1983, provides free limited instruction in reading, writing, math and ESL to adult and out-of-school youth (over 18 years old) throughout New York City. In the 1995-96 program year, NYCALI provided services to 41,005 students.</p> <p>NYCALI is funded and coordinated by MOAL and the New York State Education Department (SED). The organization is expected to receive \$13 million from the City in fiscal 1999. NYCALI receives City funds through the tax levy, the Begin Employment Gain Independence Now (BEGIN) program, and the Education for Gainful Employment (EDGE) program; state funds through Employment Preparation Education (EPE) program, the Adult Literacy Education (ALE) program and the Welfare Education Program (WEP); and the Federal government through the Adult Education Act (AEA).</p> <p>NYCALI distributes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 14 programs through the continuing education operation of the City University of New York (CUNY); • 225 programs at community-based organizations (CBOs) through the Office of Adult and Continuing Education (OACE) of the New York City Board of Education (BOE); and • 20 programs through the New York Public Library and Queens Borough Public Library; and • 40 programs through the Department of Youth and Community Development.
Management Contacts	Richard Fish, Director, MOAL Judy Alladice, Associate Director, OACE

(NYCALI continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
SUBJECT AREAS Reading	NYCALI offers the following curricula: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Basic Education (BE) in reading, writing and mathematics for students performing below the 9th grade level;• General Educational Development (GED) in high school equivalency instruction of reading, writing, math, science and social studies for students performing at or above the 9th grade level; and• Basic Education in the Native Language (BENL) in reading and writing in native languages other than English. <p>Note: Fish says that, in order to deliver pre-collegiate instruction, most CBOs would have to upgrade their curricula. He says he can think of one affiliate, the Carroll Gardens Women's Group CBO in Brooklyn, that currently has the capacity to do so.</p>
Writing	NYCALI's BE and GED curricula contain a writing component.
Mathematics	NYCALI's BE and GED curricula contain a math component.
English as a Second Language (ESL)	NYCALI's English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) curriculum enhances the listening, speaking, reading and writing skills of students with limited English proficiency. ESOL curriculum can be tailored to serve students with limited literacy skills in English and their native language.

(NYCALI continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
<p>ASSESSMENT Standardized Norm- or Criterion-Referenced Testing</p>	<p>BE: NYCALI administers the Test of Adult Basic Education (TABE) in reading and math. Students who score at or above the 9th grade level are referred to GED instruction.</p> <p>BENL: NYCALI administers an unspecified pre-test. For Spanish BENL testing, program managers may use the Spanish version of the Comprehensive Test of Basic Skills (CTBS), the Spanish Assessment of Basic Education (SABE). For BENL assessment in other languages, program managers may use a screening instrument that is available from the SED and translated into the following languages: Haitian-Creole, French, Vietnamese, Russian, Polish, Arabic, Italian, Korean and Chinese.</p> <p>ESOL: NYCALI administers the NYS PLACE, which is produced by the SED.</p>
<p>Diagnostic-Prescriptive Pre-Testing</p>	<p>NYCALI does not conduct diagnostic-prescriptive pre-testing.</p>
<p>Individualized Analysis of Basic Skills and Instructional Plans</p>	<p>NYCALI does not produce individualized instructional plans.</p>
<p>Standardized Post-Testing</p>	<p>BE: NYCALI post-tests on the TABE.</p> <p>BENL: NYCALI requires that program managers re-test on the same instrument used to pre-test.</p> <p>ESOL: NYCALI post-tests on the NYC PLACE.</p> <p>All post-testing occurs on the following schedule:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • at the end of every 100 contact hours for students in classes that meet nine or fewer hours a week; • at the end of every 200 contact hours for students in classes that meet 10 or more hours a week; and • at the end of every 50 contact hours for students in small-group classes.

(NYCALI continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
CURRICULUM Mastery Learning	NYCALI does not incorporate mastery learning into its curricula.
Adult Learning Theory	
Developmental Learning Theory	
INSTRUCTION Methods of Instruction	NYCALI does not stipulate methods of instruction and uses “anything that works” (Alladice, September 25, 1998). About 50% of all programs use some form of computer technology in the classroom.
Quality of Teaching Staff	<p>NYCALI expects program managers to have a BA – preferably an MA – administrative and fiscal skills, and experience in administering adult education programs.</p> <p>NYCALI expects teachers and counselors to have a BA and experience serving adult populations.</p> <p>NYCALI furnishes professional development through consultants, the Literacy Assistance Center, Inc. and the New York City Professional Development Consortium.</p>
Flexibility of Time and Location	NYCALI offers daytime, evening and weekend courses but does not offer courses in open entry/exit and immersion formats.

(NYCALI continued)

CRITERIA	DATA
RESULTS	<p>In 1996-97, 13,098 received BE instruction through OACE and performed in reading and math, combined, as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• 7% pre-tested below Grade 3. Although 49% post-tested, NYCALI published no data for these students.• 13% pre-tested between Grades 3-4.9. Of these, 16% gained fewer than 0.5 GLEs; 7% gained 0.5-0.9 GLEs; 19% gained 1.0-1.9 GLEs; 10% gained 2.0-2.9 GLEs; and 8% gained 3.0 or more GLEs. Forty percent did not post-test.• 19% pre-tested between Grades 5-6.9. Of these, 16% gained fewer than 0.5 GLEs; 7% gained 0.5-0.9 GLEs; 19% gained 1.0-1.9 GLEs; 11% gained 2.0-2.9 GLEs; and 6% gained 3.0 or more GLEs. Forty percent did not post-test.• 30% pre-tested between Grades 7-8.9. Of these, 15% gained fewer than 0.5 GLEs; 4% gained 0.5-0.9 GLEs; 9% gained 1.0-1.9 GLEs; 2% gained 2.0-2.9 GLEs; and 10% gained 3.0 or more GLEs. Forty-seven percent did not post-test.• 31% pre-tested between Grades 9-12 and passed the GED predictor test. Of these, 45% passed the GED test. This indicates that not all programs met the minimum passage rate of 59% and should have lost City and State funding. <p><i>We note that the post-test score distribution for all students who started the program reading at Grades 3-6.9 are nearly identical varying in rounded numbers about 1%. The likelihood of this happening must be small and makes us wonder if this data was influenced by an outside force.</i></p> <p>In 1996-97, 868 received BENL instruction through OACE and performed in reading and math, combined, as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• 84% pre-tested below Grade 3. None post-tested.• 9% pre-tested between Grades 3-4.9. Of these, all students post-tested and 89% gained fewer than 0.5 GLEs; 9% gained 1.0-1.9 GLEs; and 3% gained 2.0-2.9 GLEs.• 7% pre-tested between Grades 5-6.9. Of these, all students post-tested and 90% gained fewer than 0.5 GLEs; and 10% gained fewer than 1.0-1.9 GLEs. <p><i>We note that the post-test score distribution for all students who started the program reading at Grades 3-6.9 are nearly identical varying in rounded numbers about 1%. The likelihood of this happening must be small and makes us wonder if this data was influenced by an outside force.</i></p> <p>Although NYCALI offers pre- and post-test data for the ESOL program, the data was generated on an unknown instrument and indexing system that does not apparently correspond to percentiles, NCEs or GLEs.</p>
PRODUCTIVITY	NYCALI budgets \$54-\$63 dollars per instructional hour and per student. For 18 weeks of instruction, which approximates a semester, NYCALI's per-student cost ranges from \$567 (nine hours a week) to \$945 (15 hours a week).